

#### Legislative Assembly Province of Alberta

No. 37

# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

**Second Session** 

Twenty-Seventh Legislature

Thursday, May 7, 2009

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

## **Members' Statements**

Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Montrose, made a statement regarding the Walking Away Hunger Campaign organized by Sikh Youth Calgary to assist the Calgary Inter-faith Food Bank.

Mr. Denis, Hon. Member for Calgary-Egmont, made a statement regarding the Multiple Sclerosis Society of Canada MS Walk Campaign and recognizing May 2009 as Multiple Sclerosis Awareness Month.

Mr. Taylor, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie, made a statement regarding shortfalls in the proposed 2009 budget and the lack of written responses to questions raised during debate on the budget.

Mr. Mason, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood, made a statement regarding Bill 44, Human Rights, Citizenship and Multiculturalism Amendment Act, 2009.

Mr. Bhardwaj, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, made a statement regarding Paving Health Pathways: A Health Services Strategy, announced by the government on April 30, 2009.

Mrs. McQueen, Hon. Member for Drayton Valley-Calmar, made a statement regarding the establishment of the Climate Change and Emissions Management Corporation.

#### **Notices of Motions**

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, gave oral notice of her intention to move, pursuant to Standing Order 30, to adjourn the ordinary business of the Assembly to discuss a matter of urgent importance, namely the failure to provide written responses to questions posed during debate on the 2009-10 Main Estimates obstructs Opposition Members of the Legislative Assembly in their review and evaluation of the Budget, preventing them from making a fully informed decision on the vote.

#### **Notices of Motions**

Hon. Mr. Renner, Deputy Government House Leader, gave oral notice of Written Questions and Motions for Returns to be accepted or otherwise dealt with, pursuant to Standing Order 34(3):

#### **Motions for Returns**

To be dealt with: MR25

## **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Mr. Mason, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood:

Report, undated, entitled "Working Short Report" regarding staffing shortages at extended care homes, prepared by United Steelworkers Health Care

Sessional Paper 285/2009

Hon. Mr. Ouellette, Minister of Transportation:

Responses to questions raised by Mr. Mason, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood, Mr. Allred, Hon. Member for St. Albert, and Mr. Kang, Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall, on April 20, 2009, Department of Transportation Main Estimates debate

Sessional Paper 286/2009

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Education:

Responses to questions raised by Ms Notley, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, and Mr. Chase, Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity, on April 29, 2009, Department of Education Main Estimates debate

Sessional Paper 287/2009

## **Tablings to the Clerk**

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Hayden, Minister of Infrastructure:

Responses to questions raised by Mr. Mason, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood, and Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, on April 21, 2009, Department of Infrastructure, Main Estimates debate

Sessional Paper 288/2009

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Ms Redford, Minister of Justice and Attorney General:

Response to Written Question WQ9, asked for by Ms Notley on April 6, 2009:

How many *charges have been commenced* under the Protection of Children Involved in Prostitution Act *and the Protection of Sexually Exploited Children Act* since its implementation?

Sessional Paper 289/2009

Response to Written Question WQ16, asked for by Ms Notley on April 6, 2009:

For each of the fiscal years 2004/2005 to 2007/2008, on how many occasions were approved legal aid services not provided due to unavailability of counsel?

Sessional Paper 290/2009

Response to Written Question WQ17, asked for by Ms Notley on April 6, 2009:

For each of the fiscal years 2004/2005 to 2007/2008, what was the average income of people accessing legal aid?

Sessional Paper 291/2009

## **Projected Government Business**

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(6), Ms Blakeman, Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of May 11 to May 14, 2009:

Tuesday, May 12	Aft	Government Bills and Orders Second Reading
		Bill 27, 36, 43, 44, 45, 47
		And as per the Order Paper
	Eve	<b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		Second Reading
		Bill 25, 37, 38, 39, 40
		Committee of the Whole
		Bill 10, 12, 13, 14, 16, 33
		And as per the Order Paper
Wednesday, May 13	Aft	<b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		<b>Second Reading</b>
		Bill 20, 23, 26

#### Committee of the Whole

Bill 24, 25, 27, 28, 37, 38, 39, 40, 43, 47

And as per the Order Paper

**Eve.** - **Government Bills and Orders** 

Committee of the Whole

Bill 44, 45

And as per the Order Paper

Thursday, May 14 Aft. - Government Bills and Orders

**Second Reading** 

Bill 35

Third Reading

Bill 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 16, 24, 25, 27, 28, 33, 37, 38, 39, 40, 47

And as per the Order Paper

## Motion for Adjournment for an Emergency Debate

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, requested leave to move, pursuant to Standing Order 30, to adjourn the ordinary business of the Assembly to discuss a matter of urgent public importance, namely the failure to provide written responses to questions posed during debate on the 2009-10 Main Estimates obstructs Opposition Members of the Legislative Assembly in their review and evaluation of the Budget, preventing them from making a fully informed decision on the vote.

A debate followed on urgency.

The Speaker ruled that the request for leave was not in order.

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

## **Government Motions**

**14.** Moved by Hon. Mr. Hancock:

Be it resolved that Mr. MacDonald be appointed to the Select Standing Committee on the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund to fill a vacancy.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

#### 15. Moved by Hon. Mr. Hancock:

Be it resolved that, pursuant to Standing Order 4(1), the Assembly shall meet on Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday evenings for consideration of Government Business for the remainder of the 2009 Spring sitting unless, on motion by the Government House Leader made before 6 p.m., which may be made orally and without notice, the Assembly is adjourned to the following sitting day.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

## **Committee of Supply** (Main Estimates)

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

Mr. Doerksen, Chair, Standing Committee on Community Services, presented the following report:

The Standing Committee on Community Services has reviewed the 2009-10 proposed Estimates and Business Plans for the Departments of Culture and Community Spirit, Education, Housing and Urban Affairs, Municipal Affairs, and Tourism, Parks and Recreation.

Mr. Doerksen then presented proposed amendments to the 2009-10 Estimates for the Departments of Culture and Community Spirit, Housing and Urban Affairs, Municipal Affairs, and Tourism, Parks and Recreation.

Mr. Campbell, Chair, Standing Committee on the Economy, presented the following report:

The Standing Committee on the Economy has reviewed the 2009-10 proposed Estimates and Business Plans for the Departments of Advanced Education and Technology, Employment and Immigration, Finance and Enterprise, Infrastructure, and Transportation.

Mr. Campbell then presented proposed amendments to the 2009-10 Estimates for the Departments of Advanced Education and Technology, Employment and Immigration, Finance and Enterprise, Infrastructure, and Transportation.

Ms Pastoor, Deputy Chair, Standing Committee on Health, on behalf of Mr. Horne, Chair, Standing Committee on Health, presented the following report:

The Standing Committee on Health has reviewed the 2009-10 proposed Estimates and Business Plans for the Departments of Children and Youth Services, Health and Wellness, and Seniors and Community Supports.

Ms Pastoor then presented proposed amendments to the 2009-10 Estimates for the Departments of Health and Wellness, and Seniors and Community Supports.

Mr. VanderBurg, Chair, Standing Committee on Public Safety and Services, presented the following report:

The Standing Committee on Public Safety and Services has reviewed the 2009-10 proposed Estimates and Business Plans for the Departments of Aboriginal Relations, Justice, Service Alberta, Solicitor General and Public Security, and the Treasury Board.

Mr. VanderBurg then presented proposed amendments to the 2009-10 Estimates for the Departments of Justice, Solicitor General and Public Security, and the Treasury Board.

Ms Blakeman, Deputy Chair, Standing Committee on Resources and Environment, on behalf of Mr. Prins, Chair, Standing Committee on Resources and Environment, presented the following report:

The Standing Committee on Resources and Environment has reviewed the 2009-10 proposed Estimates and Business Plans for the Departments of Agriculture and Rural Development, Energy, Environment, International and Intergovernmental Relations, and Sustainable Resource Development.

Ms Blakeman then presented proposed amendments to the 2009-10 Estimates for the Departments of Environment, International and Intergovernmental Relations, and Sustainable Resource Development.

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.03(1)(a) the following amendments were voted on:

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Advanced Education (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 292/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Advanced Education (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 293/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Advanced Education (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 294/2009

During consideration of the 2009-10 Main Estimates, Mr. Chase moved that the estimates for Horse Racing and Breeding Renewal Program under reference 4.0.6 at page 108 of the 2009-10 Main Estimates of the Department of Culture and Community Spirit be reduced by \$33,000,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 105 for Expense and Equipment/Inventory Purchases is \$259,762,000.

The question being put, the amendment was defeated. With Mr. Cao in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 9

BlakemanKangSwannChaseMacDonaldTaftHehrMasonTaylor

Against the amendment: 33

Allred Rogers Horner Sandhu **Benito** Jacobs Bhullar Sherman Klimchuk Blackett Lindsay Snelgrove Brown Lund Stevens Calahasen McFarland Tarchuk Campbell Mitzel VanderBurg Dallas Oberle Weadick Evans Olson Woo-Paw Hancock Ouellette Xiao Hayden Ouest Zwozdesky

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Culture and Community Spirit (Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity) — Defeated on division

Sessional Paper 295/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Employment and Immigration (Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 296/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Environment (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 297/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of Executive Council (introduced by the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview on behalf of the Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition on April 15, 2009) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 298/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of Executive Council (introduced by the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview on behalf of the Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition on April 15, 2009) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 299/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Finance and Enterprise (Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 300/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Finance and Enterprise (Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 301/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Finance and Enterprise (Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 302/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Health and Wellness (Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East,) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 303/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Housing and Urban Affairs (Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 304/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Infrastructure (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 305/2009

During consideration of the 2009-10 Main Estimates, Mr. Hehr moved that the estimates for Corporate Services under reference 1.0.4 of the 2009-10 Main Estimates of the Department of International and Intergovernmental Relations be reduced by \$75,000 so that the amount to be voted for Expense and Equipment/Inventory Purchases is \$26,272,000.

The question being put, the amendment was defeated. With Mr. Cao in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 9

BlakemanKangSwannChaseMacDonaldTaftHehrMasonTaylor

Against the amendment: 31

Allred Horner Rogers Benito Jacobs Sandhu Sherman Bhullar Klimchuk Snelgrove Blackett Lindsay Tarchuk Brown McFarland Calahasen Mitzel VanderBurg Weadick Campbell Oberle Woo-Paw Dallas Olson Evans Ouellette Xiao Hancock Quest Zwozdesky Hayden

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of International and Intergovernmental Relations (Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) — Defeated on division

Sessional Paper 306/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Justice (Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 307/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Municipal Affairs (Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 308/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Seniors and Community Supports (Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 309/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Solicitor General and Public Security (Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 310/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Sustainable Resource Development (Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 311/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Tourism, Parks and Recreation (Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 312/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Tourism, Parks and Recreation (Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 313/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Transportation (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 314/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Transportation (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 315/2009

Amendment to the Estimates of the Treasury Board (Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 316/2009

The question was put on all resolutions for the 2009-10 Government Estimates for the General Revenue Fund and Lottery Fund, which was agreed to. With Mr. Cao in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 31

Allred Horner Benito Jacobs Bhullar Klimchuk Blackett Lindsay Brown Lund Calahasen McFarland Campbell Mitzel Dallas Oberle Evans Ouellette Hancock Quest Hayden

Rogers
Sandhu
Sherman
Snelgrove
Tarchuk
VanderBurg
Weadick
Woo-Paw
Xiao
Zwozdesky

Against the motion: 10

Blakeman MacDonald Swann
Chase Mason Taft
Hehr Pastoor Taylor
Kang

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair and Dr. Brown reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the 2009-10 Offices of the Legislative Assembly Estimates, Government Estimates and the Lottery Fund, reports as follows, and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2010, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

## **Support to the Legislative Assembly**

Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$58,450,000
Office of the Auditor General	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$23,221,000
Office of the Ombudsman	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$2,911,000
Office of the Chief Electoral Officer	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$4,951,000
Office of the Ethics Commissioner	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$991,000
Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$5,741,000
Aboriginal Relations	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$149,966,000
Advanced Education and Technology	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$2,977,132,000 \$139,300,000
Agriculture and Rural Development	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$622,857,000
Children and Youth Services	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$1,136,277,000

Culture and Community Spirit			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$292,762,000 \$2,685,000		
Education			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$4,298,126,000 \$1,000,000		
<b>Employment and Immigration</b>			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$1,015,356,000		
Energy			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$252,614,000		
Environment			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$251,747,000 \$1,100,000		
<b>Executive Council</b>			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$35,880,000		
Finance and Enterprise			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$479,289,000 \$43,660,000		
Health and Wellness			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment	\$12,962,471,000 \$19,200,000		
Housing and Urban Affairs			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$532,027,000		
Infrastructure			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment	\$585,195,000 \$588,929,000		
International and Intergovernmental Relations			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$26,347,000		
Justice			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$461,653,000		
Municipal Affairs			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$593,970,000		
Seniors and Community Supports			
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$1,971,785,000		

#### Service Alberta

Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment	\$366,018,000 \$92,500,000
Solicitor General and Public Security	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment Lottery Fund Payments	\$601,316,000 \$35,061,000 \$1,497,927,000
Sustainable Resource Development	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment	\$335,893,000 \$20,450,000
Tourism, Parks and Recreation	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$190,761,000 \$17,284,000 \$375,000
Transportation	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases Capital Investment Non-budgetary Disbursements	\$2,282,706,000 \$1,482,278,000 \$6,545,000
Treasury Board	
Expense and Equipment / Inventory Purchases	\$242,481,000

Dr. Brown then tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of Supply on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

## **Government Bills and Orders**

## **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 44 Human Rights, Citizenship and Multiculturalism Amendment Act, 2009 — Hon. Mr. Blackett

A debate followed.

Dr. Sherman moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

# Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 4:26~p.m. until Monday, May 11,2009, at 1:30~p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski, Speaker

Title: Thursday, May 7, 2009